

**IS RECRUITMENT BROKEN OR JUST OUT OF DATE?**

by Nigel L Job & Lorna H Rutter

# IS RECRUITMENT BROKEN



## OR JUST OUT OF DATE?

How to Modernize Your Hiring  
to Supercharge Growth

by Nigel L Job & Lorna H Rutter

The rights of Nigel L. Job and Lorna H. Rutter to be identified as the authors of this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the prior written permission of the publisher. Any person who does any unauthorized act

relation to this publication may be liable for criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

Artwork by Jason Smith - [www.macaruba.com](http://www.macaruba.com)

Copyright © 2020 Nigel L. Job and Lorna H. Rutter

All rights reserved.

ISBN 9798651139859

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Case Studies.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Example 1: Muldowney Legal .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Example 2: SubGaia Technology Ltd .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>Example 3: Acme Medical Inc. ....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Chapter 1 The Economics of Getting it Right or Wrong .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>Assessment one: The economic impact of short-term unsuccessful hiring</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Exercise one: Short term tenure impact on your business.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>Assessment two: The economic effect of incumbent underperforming employees</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Exercise two: Actual Performance V Performance Expectation</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>Chapter 2 A structured recruiting timetable for success .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>A successful recruitment process .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>Chapter 3 High Performance Talent Focus: What Does ‘Great’ Look Like?</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>What is diversity and why is it important? .....</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>Exercise Three : Diversity and Inclusion.....</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>Assessment 3 – What attracted your top performers? .....</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>The Seven Indicators of High Performance Talent.....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Exercise Four: HPT Indicators Criteria Matrix.....</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>Assessment 4 - HPT Characteristics assessment chart .....</b>	<b>60</b>
<b>Chapter 4 The Importance of Employer Branding to attract High Performance Talent</b>	<b>65</b>
<b>Employee Value Proposition.....</b>	<b>68</b>
<b>How your employer brand can attract HPTs .....</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>Measuring the effectiveness of Employer Branding .....</b>	<b>74</b>
<b>Exercise Five: What makes you a stand out employer? .....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>Assessment 5 -Why would someone want to work for you &amp; your company?</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>Chapter 5 Business Needs Analysis .....</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>Understanding the key elements for a role .....</b>	<b>84</b>
<b>Learning from previous successes and mistakes .....</b>	<b>87</b>
<b>Summarizing the skills you need .....</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>Assessment six: Essential Skills .....</b>	<b>92</b>
<b>Exercise Six - Essential and desirable skills need analysis .....</b>	<b>93</b>
<b>Writing an effective job description .....</b>	<b>95</b>

<b>Exercise Seven – Create a Job Description and Person Specification</b>	<b>101</b>
<b>Chapter 6 Candidate generation methods.....</b>	<b>103</b>
<b>Personal recommendation of hiring manager.....</b>	<b>106</b>
<b>Advertising.....</b>	<b>107</b>
<b>Social media.....</b>	<b>111</b>
<b>Hashtags.....</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>Company referral schemes .....</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>Internal Talent Acquisition (TA) team.....</b>	<b>116</b>
<b>Contingency recruitment companies.....</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>A retained search-consultancy partner.....</b>	<b>123</b>
<b>Temporary or contract/interim recruitment.....</b>	<b>126</b>
<b>Chapter 7 Short Listing, Interview and Assessment .....</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>Getting your management team(s) fit for purpose .....</b>	<b>129</b>
<b>CV reading and interpretation .....</b>	<b>133</b>
<b>Interviewing: preparation and interview skills.....</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>Function based questions .....</b>	<b>140</b>
<b>Performance based questions.....</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>HPT behavior differentiator questions .....</b>	<b>142</b>
<b>Exercise Eight – Role specific Interview questions.....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>General interview skills: the ‘first’ interview .....</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>How to structure the interview.....</b>	<b>148</b>
<b>Second or subsequent Interviews .....</b>	<b>152</b>
<b>Additional methods of assessment .....</b>	<b>152</b>
<b>Reference Checking.....</b>	<b>157</b>
<b>Chapter 8 Hiring Success and Beyond .....</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>The offer.....</b>	<b>163</b>
<b>Post-hire quality process .....</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>Chapter 9 Staff Retention.....</b>	<b>170</b>
<b>Employee turnover.....</b>	<b>171</b>
<b>What is the tenure of staff who are leaving? .....</b>	<b>173</b>
<b>Benefits of an exit interview .....</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>Overall business performance .....</b>	<b>174</b>
<b>Distribution of workload and productivity.....</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>Employer brand and company image .....</b>	<b>176</b>

<b>Team development .....</b>	<b>177</b>
<b>Is there ever a good time to have staff turnover? .....</b>	<b>177</b>
<b>Staff turnover is low but it's the high performers who are leaving</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>How to work with staff turnover to develop a high performance workforce</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>Staff Retention Strategies.....</b>	<b>182</b>
<b>Epilogue .....</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>Summary .....</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>ABOUT THE AUTHORS.....</b>	<b>191</b>

### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Our sincere thanks to all of the many people who have contributed to this book through their direct advice when we were researching. Also to all of our colleagues and clients and interviewees, past and present, who are the backbone of the inspiration for it.

## Introduction

Recruitment and retention is key to your business growth. Whether we are in boom times or recession there is always a shortage of highly talented people at all levels. It is therefore an area of competition that your company should master in order to compete. And yet, “recruitment is broken”, or so say many on the subject. What do they mean?

What they seem to mean is that the recruitment systems that companies use no longer work well; that candidates are treated poorly thereby damaging company employer brand; recruitment companies offer a poor and expensive service, and the results that employers get are inconsistent at best.

Is this a new phenomenon or has it always been thus?

The truth is that it probably always has been an area of human resource management that is in urgent need of a rethink. Most employers have not yet woken up to how bad their recruiting systems are, and how easily they can be improved. We use the word “systems” advisedly, because the real truth is most companies’ approach to recruitment, selection and retention has anything but a systematic approach. What definitely *is* new is the plethora of approaches that companies can use to compete in this essential aspect of business growth. Genuine professional talent management is still in its embryonic stages in almost all companies. Recruitment is part of this, and of course one of the reasons why many consider recruitment to be “broken” is because there is little connection to retention, but more broadly a disconnect to other strategic areas of business.

Essentially, most recruiting and retention strategies used by companies are not in the least strategic.



They are fundamentally basic, badly integrated, and completely inadequate for the times that we live in. One of the fundamental reasons many companies' recruitment processes are not competing is because they are still employing and displaying attitudes that in reality were poor quality in the past, and completely inappropriate for the future, and their attempts to use modern technologies and methods are inept and amateurish, with a focus on completely the wrong metrics.

The current recruitment market is massively different from what it once was. This offers both opportunities and threats.

However, whether we look at the most modern methods of recruitment, or the more traditional, the root cause of the "broken recruitment" problem is a lack of focus on how to achieve a system of excellence that outperforms your competitors. Sadly, most employers do not know what good looks like, let alone "excellent" when it comes to hiring systems and processes, and the recruitment industry that ostensibly supports this effort does not, for the large part, have the guts to tell their clients what really needs to be done! There appears to be a non-symbiotic relationship between employers and the recruitment industry. In many, if not most cases, it is a relationship of supplier and purchaser rather than partner/advisor. If you are not receiving the recruitment service from either your internal or external partners that you think you deserve, it is not necessarily the case that recruitment is broken per se, but it is probably the case that YOUR recruitment systems are almost certainly sub-optimal.

One area that we will focus on heavily through this book is a clear philosophy to drive growth through your organization; make it your top strategic objective to *hire* and then *retain high performers*. A complaint from many hiring managers and HR professionals is that the quality of people they see is not meeting their expectations. Paradoxically, we will be encouraging you to be even more demanding in what you require. This might suggest you will make your task even harder, but this will not be the case if you follow the principles we outline in the following pages.

The market for high performers in all sectors is what recruiters refer to as "candidate led". This means that it is a "sellers-market" for their services, and, as already mentioned, it is really immaterial whether we are in a boom time or a recession. The reason for this is that in recession people are more cautious and less likely to move, so while there may be a larger number of people "between jobs", there will still be a very limited availability of high performers. If you are an employer that wants such high performing growth supercharging people, you are going to have to work hard to attract them, and if you do not, your competitors will take them instead!

The internet and social media platforms that are now part of our everyday lives mean that the way potential applicants interact with possible employers/recruiters and vice versa is completely different to what it was ten years ago. If you *are* still using the methods you used ten years ago, then as suggested a few paragraphs ago you are at a disadvantage. If you are

adapting to the new environment, you need to understand how to do this optimally.

You will also be wise to understand the pressures that the new recruitment environment places on your existing staff. As it becomes easier for your best staff to be found by other employers, how do you ensure they are not tempted away? After all, you will not grow your business if having hired the right people you lose them in short order! It is certainly a broken system that hires great people and then lets them drift off before giving a clear return on investment.

One of the major obstacles to success is not only that many companies' line managers are unaware of the current dynamic in the recruitment market, but also that they have had minimal training or experience in how to interview and select. How broken is that? It is quite extraordinary that such a mission critical skillset for any manager or leader is left so much to chance. How many other management functions are carried out by individuals that have little training or instruction in that function? Not many perhaps.

If you are in charge of P&L for your business unit or company, and you are not a trained accountant, the likelihood is that you will have had at least received a training course in "finance for non-financial managers", or something of that type. If you need to do presentations to internal or external customers you will have been on presentation skills courses. And as for general leadership and management, it could be argued that you should be continually learning and developing yourself in this area if you have line management responsibility for others.

This book will help to address this gap, demonstrating best practice and most up to date principles for recruiting with a focus on accessing high performers and how to engage with them.

**Interview and selection process improvement, when combined with a strong retention strategy is one of the most significant but straightforward management improvement processes that you can implement.**

Whatever type of people you hire, whether they are people with a commercial target, such as lawyers, accountants or salespeople; or perhaps they are bench scientists working on a time critical project, the difference between poor performers and overperformers may well be the difference between overall success or failure of your business or organization.

The baseline quality of your team, and therefore much of its performance, is dependent on two straightforward factors: *how they are selected and how they are led.*

Leadership has had much written on it, and we will not be covering that here. However, how can you have a decent team to lead, if you haven't selected them well in the first instance? This book will take you on a journey that will demonstrate the value of a modern, outward looking and proactive selection process that will result in you hiring much higher-quality,

higher-performing people and, subsequently, greater success for your organization. Those higher quality people we will refer to as High Performance Talent or HPT. This does not mean that we are only referring to geniuses, or super people. We are simply referring to those that are consistently at the top end of their professional capability when compared to their peer group.

Can all organizations aim at such groups?

**Yes, definitely!**

If you want to see increased productivity through improved talent there are a number of key elements that need to be grasped:

- Accessing High Performance Talent needs to be a key strategic objective of the organization that is prioritized to the very top of the leadership team, and “buy-in” achieved right through the organizational structure.
- People are not commodities, the highest quality people need to be competed for. The best candidates have the pick of employers, not the out of date attitude that believes it is the other way around.
- A robust process must be put in place to ensure that consistency is applied throughout the recruitment program, across the organization and outcomes are measured.

If the principles given here are followed, you will save many hours of lost time and lost productivity in the future, that would have been caused through taking the wrong approach, interviewing the wrong people and worse still, hiring the wrong people.

**When these principles are applied, your recruitment processes will be far from broken or out of date, they will be high performance. High Performance Hiring processes will lead to High Performance Talent being attracted to your organization and supercharging its future growth.**